Using Futures Spreads to Manage Basis Risk:

Introduction:

In managing the risk of an adverse change in cash prices, there are essentially two risks exposed to this change in price. A cash price consists of both a futures component or benchmark price, as well as a basis differential that relates that futures value or benchmark to a local cash market in which the commodity will be priced. By definition, CASH = FUTURES + BASIS; therefore, BASIS = CASH - FUTURES. Often, futures are used as a hedge against an adverse move in cash prices. If futures are priced as a substitute to a cash purchase or sale, then this element of price is covered or hedged; however, the basis differential remains a floating variable to the final determinant price and is itself exposed to adverse variation in its value between the time the futures are hedged and the time the hedge is removed and the cash price is set in the local market.

As a long hedger (someone who is short the physical commodity in the cash market), one is exposed to a stronger basis. As a short hedger (someone who is long the physical commodity in the cash market), one is exposed to a weaker basis. The graph below illustrates the movement of basis and its impact on the long and short hedger.

\[
\begin{array}{c|c|c}
\text{Strengthen} & +30 & +20 \\
\text{Becomes More Positive} & +10 & 0 \\
\text{} & -10 & -20 \\
\text{} & -30 & \\
\text{Weakens} & \\
\text{Becomes Less Positive} & \\
\end{array}
\]

- +30: hurts a long hedger, helps a short hedger
- +20: hurts a long hedger, helps a short hedger
- +10: hurts a long hedger, helps a short hedger
- 0: hurts a long hedger, helps a short hedger
- -10: hurts a long hedger, helps a short hedger
- -20: hurts a long hedger, helps a short hedger
- -30: hurts a long hedger, helps a short hedger

Hedging Basis:

Fortunately, basis variation is the smaller portion of overall price variation. By most measures, futures variation accounts for approximately 80% of the overall variation in cash prices. Despite this, unfavorable movements in basis can limit the effectiveness of a futures or options hedge in protecting price. For many markets, including corn, soybean meal and hogs, basis can be set independent of price well ahead of time, thus removing this variable cash price risk from the equation. Unfortunately, because of uncertainties associated with basis movement – particularly in years of extreme price volatility – the
costs associated with establishing basis can be high and the forward basis value offered in
the cash market can appear unattractive relative to historical levels.

As an alternative to forward pricing basis, futures spreads can be used to hedge the basis
element of a cash price. The reasoning behind this is that basis and spreads tend to move
together. As an example, in situations where the cash market is very strong, basis tends
to be increasing. This typically is reflected in the spot futures contract gaining relative to
defered contracts. In the opposite case where the cash market is very weak, basis tends
to be decreasing and this usually corresponds with spot futures declining relative to
defered contracts.

With respect to futures spreads, the direction of the underlying market is not necessarily
indicative of how a spread will perform. In other words, just because a market is moving
higher does not necessarily mean that spot contracts are gaining on deferred contracts.
Similarly, just because the underlying market is moving lower does not automatically
mean that spot contracts are losing on deferred contracts.

One way to think of this is in the case where a declining market discourages cash sales
and begins to strengthen basis levels. This often leads to strength in spot contracts
relative to deferred contracts. This can occur even as futures continue moving lower – it
happens when the spot contract is not going down as much as deferred contracts are in an
overall declining market.

To hedge against the risk of a stronger basis, a bull spread would be used which consists
of buying a futures contract with a nearby expiration, and selling a futures contract with a
later expiration. To hedge against the risk of a weaker basis, a bear spread would be used
which consists of selling a futures contract with a nearby expiration, and buying a futures
contract with a later expiration.

It is important to realize that a futures spread will not necessarily offset basis risk in a
local cash market on a one-for-one basis. In other words, if corn basis in my local cash
market moves up by 10 cents, spot futures will not necessarily gain 10 cents on deferred
futures. This is because there is a bit of a disconnection between any specific local cash
market and the futures market. The futures market serves as a benchmark price for the
collective cash market across many different locations. In any given locale,
supply/demand fundamentals specific to that area can lead to basis fluctuations that are
distinct and separate from the rest of the country.

The point is that basis and spreads tend to move together. If the overall trend of the cash
market is a strengthening basis, this tends to correspond with spot futures contracts
gaining on deferred futures contracts while if the overall trend of the cash market is a
weakening basis, this tends to correspond with spot futures contracts losing ground to
defered futures contracts. If the basis movement in a local cash market is not reflected
in the general trend of basis across the rest of the country, it will not likely be reflected in
the movement of futures spreads either.
Another important point to note is that using a futures spread to hedge basis risk is separate and distinct from using futures or options to hedge price risk. As an example, if I am short hog futures as a hedge against lower cash prices in a forward period, and in addition, I am short nearby futures and long deferred futures, these are two separate positions hedging two separate risks. In fact, these basis hedge positions are typically segregated in a separate account to prevent unintentional offsets of price hedges. To illustrate the point, let’s consider the following theoretical hedges for exposure on 2Q and 3Q live cattle:

2Q: Short 10 June Live Cattle Futures  
3Q: Short 10 August Live Cattle Futures

Next, let’s consider the following bear spread to hedge against a weaker basis on 2Q live cattle:

Sell June Futures, Buy 10 August Futures

If I were to place this hedge into my live cattle account, the long August futures position of the 2Q basis hedge would offset the short August futures position of my third quarter price hedge, which I do not want to do. Therefore need to create a separate place to put these positions to prevent this offsetting and to better keep track of the performance of the basis hedge relative to the price hedge.

It is also important to note that the purpose of using futures spreads is to hedge the risk of a stronger or weaker basis, not to make money on the spread. In the aforementioned example, assuming I sell June futures and buy August futures as a 2Q basis hedge, if the June contract gains on the August contract I will lose money on the spread; however, this should be offset by a stronger basis in the cash market. If I am selling my cattle to the packer at a stronger basis, this improves my overall price and is favorable for my 2Q margin, which is what I want for the beef operation.

**Seasonality of Basis:**

Just as futures prices display seasonal tendencies, so does basis. As an example, corn basis tends to be the weakest around harvest time when a surge of supply moves into the cash market pipeline. Conversely, corn basis typically strengthens in the spring during planting time as most producers are preoccupied in the field and not delivering any supply to their local elevators. Because basis itself has seasonality, one can reference seasonal basis patterns to help optimize cash purchases and sales. The following chart illustrates live cattle basis in various Midwest feedlots since 2002:
From the above chart, one can notice that there has been a general tendency for live cattle basis in this region to decrease starting in March. Interestingly, this usually corresponds to a period in which the cash live cattle market itself seasonally moves lower. While not always the case, it is not uncommon for basis and price to move in opposite directions. This helps illustrate why it is optimal to separate the two components in managing price, and manage the associated risks of basis and price separately as well.

As you may have already contemplated, because there are seasonal basis patterns, there are also seasonal patterns to futures spreads. This is logical as the two are related to one another. In managing a basis risk using futures spreads, it is helpful to be aware of these seasonal tendencies when it comes to timing both the implementation and removal of these hedges. In a previous example, we looked at using a bear spread to hedge against a decline in basis for 2Q Live Cattle. This consisted of selling June futures and buying August futures. The following chart illustrates the 15-year seasonal pattern of that futures spread:
One can see from the above chart that there is a very strong seasonal tendency June futures to begin losing ground relative to August futures from the month of March into May.

Executing a Futures Spread as a Basis Hedge for Live Cattle:

Now let us assume that it is early March and we are considering a forward basis quote from our packer for cattle to be delivered during the middle of May. Let us further assume that the forward offer from our packer is quite weak compared to the current spot quote, and consequently, we do not want to lock this level in. We remain concerned that basis values in 3 months time could be considerably weaker than where they are presently in the spot market, and we wish to protect ourselves from this basis risk. As an alternative to locking in the forward basis offered by our packer, we could initiate a bear spread, selling June futures and buying August futures simultaneously. Remember, this is independent from any price hedge we may have in place to protect lower 2Q live cattle values – we are only addressing the basis risk component of the cattle to be delivered during this time frame.

When executing a spread order, we typically specify the premium at which we wish to initiate the position. Continuing with the previous example, let us assume the following futures values for both the June and August live cattle futures contracts:
June: $88.00/cwt.
August: $86.00/cwt.

We wish to go ahead with this basis hedge and initiate the bear spread. We could simply enter an order at the market to sell June Live Cattle and buy August Live Cattle; however, if we wish to guarantee no worse than the differential between the two contracts we witness above then the order would be entered as follows:

Sell 10 June Live Cattle and Buy 10 August Live Cattle at $2.00 premium to the June sell side. Generally speaking, when placing a limit order on a spread, we specify the price by looking at which contract is trading at a premium to the other and stating the differential based on that premium. Assuming the prices were reversed (August trading at $88.00 and June trading at $86.00), the order would read as follows: Sell 10 June Live Cattle and Buy 10 August Live Cattle at $2.00 premium to the August buy side.

The most important thing to keep in mind when executing a spread is which contract to sell versus which to buy. To execute a *bear spread*, we would be *selling* a contract with a *nearby expiration* and *buying* a contract with a *deferred expiration*. To execute a *bull spread*, we would be *buying* a contract with a *nearby expiration* and *selling* a contract with a *deferred expiration*.

Continuing with the above example, let us assume that we go ahead with the bear spread and now have the following position in our spread account for basis hedges:

Short 10 June Live Cattle @ $88.00/cwt.
Long 10 August Live Cattle @ $86.00/cwt.

Also, let’s assume that it is early March and our current spot basis for live cattle is option price (we can sell our cattle at parity to April futures). Now let’s advance the clock ahead 9 weeks and assume it is mid-May. We observe the following spot basis for live cattle and futures prices in the marketplace:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Futures/Contract</th>
<th>Price</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>June Live Cattle Futures</td>
<td>$82.00/cwt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August Live Cattle Futures</td>
<td>$84.00/cwt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spot Basis for Cash Cattle</td>
<td>$6.00/cwt. under June futures</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

We sell our cattle to the packer at $6.00/cwt. under June futures and simultaneously remove our basis hedge. To do this, we need to buy June futures and sell August futures. Again, assuming we want to assure no worse than the differential we see above, the order would be placed as follows:

Buy 10 June Live Cattle and Sell 10 August Live Cattle @ $2.00 premium to the August sell side. This order is filled and we calculate the following P&L on our basis hedge:

Sold 10 June Live Cattle Futures @ $88.00/cwt., bought June Live Cattle Futures @ $82.00/cwt. = $6.00/cwt. gain = $24,000.
Bought 10 August Live Cattle Futures @ $86.00/cwt., sold 10 August Live Cattle Futures @ $84.00/cwt. = $2.00/cwt. loss = ($8,000).

Net P&L = $6.00/cwt. gain - $2.00/cwt. loss = $4.00/cwt. gain = $16,000.

Now let us look at the cash market side of the ledger. When we executed our bear spread in early March, spot live cattle basis was trading at parity to the board. When we offset our bear spread in mid-May, the spot basis had weakened to $6.00 under the board. The spread thus was effective in protecting $4.00/cwt. out of a total $6.00/cwt. drop in basis levels. It is important to note that even though the spread made money ($4.00/cwt.), we are actually worse off by $2.00/cwt. because the basis weakened by more than what the futures spread gained. Again, the objective is not to make money on the spread, but to protect an adverse move in the basis.

It is also important to remember that this $4.00/cwt. gain on the bear spread is only protecting any weakness in basis over a given time frame. If we had no price protection on during this period, there would have been another $6.00/cwt. opportunity cost in the loss on June futures during this period between early March and mid-May referencing the prices above. A separate hedge would have been needed to address this risk component, either in the form of a hedge-to-arrive contract with the packer, a short futures position, a long put option or some type of option spread that would protect live cattle prices in a declining market.

**Executing a Futures Spread as a Basis Hedge for Corn:**

Now let’s consider an example as a long hedger (one who is short the physical commodity in the cash market). We are coming into harvest and are concerned that corn basis may strengthen in our local market, even if futures are moving lower as additional supply fills the cash pipeline. Just as in the previous example with live cattle, we are interested in protecting our price exposure on the basis component of this open market risk; however, we are not satisfied with the forward basis offer we receive from our local elevator to lock in a basis for corn to be picked up in late November. As an alternative to locking in this forward basis offer from our elevator, we could initiate a bull spread, which will consist of buying December futures and selling March futures. The following chart illustrates the 15-year seasonal pattern of that futures spread:
Just as we observed seasonality in the previous hog spread example, one can see from the above chart that there is a strong seasonal tendency for December corn to begin gaining on March corn from late September into mid December. Continuing on with the hedge example, let us assume that it is late September and we witness the following prices in the marketplace:

- December Corn Futures: $2.30/bu.
- March Corn Futures: $2.39/bu.
- Spot Basis for Cash Corn: $0.15/bu. under December futures

We decide to go ahead with the bull spread to protect basis risk on corn. Like the hog example, we could simply place an order to buy December futures and sell March futures; however, if we wish to guarantee no worse than the differential we see above, then the order would be entered as follows:

Buy 10 December Corn and sell 10 March Corn at 9 cents to the March sell side. Again, just as was the case in the hog spread example, we specify the limit price in placing the spread order by looking at which contract is trading at a premium to the other and stating the differential based on that premium. Remember, in executing a bull spread, we are
buying a contract with a nearby expiration (in this case the December) and selling a contract with a deferred expiration (in this case the March). Continuing with the above example, let us assume that we go ahead with the bull spread and now have the following position in our spread account for basis hedges:

Long 10 December Corn @ $2.30/bu.
Short 10 March Corn @ $2.39/bu.

Also, let’s assume that it is late September and our current spot basis for corn is $0.15/bu. under December futures. Now let’s advance the clock ahead 2 months and assume it is late November. We observe the following spot basis for cash corn and futures prices in the marketplace:

December Corn Futures: $2.45/bu.
March Corn Futures: $2.50/bu.
Spot Basis for Cash Corn: $0.09/bu. under December futures

We purchase our corn from the local elevator at $0.09/bu. under December futures and simultaneously remove our basis hedge. To do this, we need to sell December futures and buy March futures. Again, assuming we want to assure no worse than the differential we see above, the order would be placed as follows:

Sell 10 December Corn and Buy 10 March Corn @ $0.05 premium to the March buy side. This order is filled and we calculate the following P&L on our basis hedge:

Bought 10 December Corn @ $2.30/bu., sold 10 December Corn @ $2.45/bu. = $0.15/bu. gain = $7,500.

Sold 10 March Corn @ $2.39/bu., bought 10 March Corn @ $2.50/bu. = $0.11/bu. loss = ($5,500).

Net P&L = $0.15/bu. gain - $0.11/bu. loss = $0.04/bu. gain = $2,000.

Now let us compare this to the cash market side of the ledger. When we executed our bull spread in late September, spot corn basis was trading at $0.15/bu. under December futures. When we offset our bull spread in late November, the spot basis had strengthened to $0.09/bu. under December futures. The spread thus was effective in protecting $0.04/bu. out of a total $0.06/bu. increase in basis levels. It is important to note that even though the spread made money ($0.04/bu.), we are actually worse off by $0.02/bu. because the basis strengthened by more than what the futures spread gained. Again, just as in the hog example previously, the objective is not to make money on the spread, but to protect an adverse move in the basis.

It is also important to remember that this $0.04/bu. gain on the bull spread is only protecting any strengthening in basis over a given time frame. If we had no price protection on during this period, there would have been another $0.15/bu. opportunity
cost in the gain on December futures during this period between late September and late November referencing the prices above. A separate hedge would have been needed to address this risk component, either in the form of a hedge-to-arrive contract with the elevator, a long futures position, a long call, or some type of option spread that would protect corn prices in a rising market.

****

One important point to emphasize on all of these basis hedge examples is the seasonality of the futures spreads. Unlike a price hedge where there is a high degree of correlation between the cash price and the futures price, there is not as high a correlation between local cash basis variation and variation in the associated futures spreads. Because of this, it is often optimal to time the implementation and removal of these futures spreads with the seasonal tendencies, not necessarily with setting the basis in the local market.

Please contact us directly for further explanation and specific applications addressing your basis exposure.

All futures spread charts were provided courtesy of Moore Research Center, Inc. For more information on the seasonality of these spreads, and/or to subscribe please visit: www.mrci.com.